

“Energy Policy Review Commission–Data Request” Unofficial Minutes

Friday, March 29, 2013

11:30AM – 12:30PM

EEA – 100 Cambridge Street

2nd Floor Conference Room A

Members in Attendance:

Bob Rio	A.I.M
Sandra Merrick	AGO
Robert Kaufmann	Boston University

Others in Attendance:

Rep. Matt Beaton	MA State Representatives
Hinna Upal	EEA
Kevin Galligan	Care Light Compact
Tina Halfpenny	DOER
Stolle Singleton	Office of House Minority Leader
Dan Burgess	EEA
Barbara Kates-Garnick	EEA
Lauren Farrell	EEA
Anna Grace	AGO
Jodi Hanover	Rich May
Martha Broad	MassCEC
Brenda Lashih-Connolly	DPU
Sean Hanley	DPU
David Cash	DPU
Mark Sylvia	DOER
Birud Jhaveri	DOER

Documents passed out:

- Agenda

Undersecretary Kates-Garnick called the meeting to order at 11:36AM.

Introduction

Undersecretary Kates-Garnick started the introductions around the room and stated the purpose of the meeting was to address Bob Rio’s data request. She said that while there might not be sufficient time to address his data request on “jobs”, between the agencies, there should be enough firepower to answer his questions. She also stated that it was important to keep these meetings open and transparent.

Data Request Discussion

Commissioner Cash asked how Mr. Rio’s request was different from what was filed in the 3-year Plan. Mr. Rio responded that he doesn’t need Energy Efficiency data as it is easily acceptable and that in his request he tried to cover all topics under the Commission. Commissioner Cash asked how fine-grain Mr. Rio wanted his data requests. Mr. Rio explained that he felt the State has lost track of data as each program is monitored differently. Commissioner Sylvia stated that this data can be found in the “RPS

Disclaimer: These minutes are not intended as a verbatim transcript of comments at the meeting, but a summary of the discussion which took place; nor does this document attest to the completeness, reliability, or suitability of this information.

and APS Annual Compliance Reports” online. Mr. Rio responded that he is not looking for new data. He went on to say that this data can be hard to find so he would like a place or spreadsheet where all of the data could be easily found. Birud Jhaveri asked Mr. Rio if he is looking for current and projected costs, which is easy to get for Energy Efficiency but can be difficult for Renewables. Mr. Rio replied that he is fine with a high/low format. Commissioner Cash asked if Mr. Rio would like the data aggregated to which Mr. Rio replied that he would he would, and that he can make his own assumptions, calculations, and conclusions from there. He went on further to say that he is looking for all the costs that were covered in the AG’s presentation from the prior meeting (net-metering; smart grid; utility owned solar; LT Renewables; Renewable Energy Carve Out; RPS Standard; Energy Efficiency; Conservation) Commissioner Cash inquired if Mr. Rio was looking for quantifiable and non-quantifiable benefits as well. Mr. Rio agreed and reminded the Commission that he is not “anti Energy Efficiency”. Professor Kaufmann included that he would like to see as much metric and non-metric benefits as possible. Mr. Rio stated that he would be content with a spreadsheet of all the programs. Professor Kaufmann suggested data for time points (ie: hourly basis) would be helpful as well. Mr. Rio interjected that he is not looking to “bash” any of the State programs. Commissioner Sylvia agreed that the agencies know that and this collection of data is actually helpful for them to see.

Undersecretary Kates-Garnick stopped the conversation to introduce Rep. Beaton who joined the meeting belatedly and for his benefit, started introductions around the room once again.

Commissioner Cash stated that between the agencies, the data can be pulled together in a spreadsheet, though not in a total granular level. Mr. Rio agreed this was a good start.

Professor Kaufmann questioned if this data would be made available to the entire Commission. Undersecretary Kates-Garnick replied that it would be made available to the Commission as it is important to keep the transparency. She then turned the conversation to Martha Broad to discuss Mr. Rio’s request for data on “jobs”.

Martha Broad stated that she has not contacted Mr. Rio directly to avoid conflicting with the Open Meeting Law but would answer his questions during this meeting. Sandra Merrick said that she had questions in how the jobs were calculated in the MassCEC Report and if they could be translated to FTE units. Ms. Broad replied that the data could be aggregated into FTE. Ms. Merrick stated that she would also like to see the data in a time perspective. Mr. Broad replied that the data is for the years 2011-2013. She went on to explain that while there is an estimate for 2010, MassCEC did not go further back due to the report methodology. Commissioner Cash explained that MassCEC hired a consultant for their Clean Industry Report and found a good methodology to go from this point on. Mr. Rio responded that the report did not identify if the jobs were created due to policy in Massachusetts. Ms. Broad answered that the intent of the report was not to slice jobs and found that policies were supportive. She then stated that the Clean Industry Report was done in response to Legislation and asked if Mr. Rio wanted an entirely different report. Dan Burgess added that this jobs data request could be added to the Commission report. Professor Kaufmann asked if MassCEC tracked grants that were given to business and their success. Ms. Broad replied that research could be done. Commissioner Sylvia stated the MassCEC report was meant to be all encompassing and suggested having the MassCEC consultant attend a future meeting to speak briefly on his methodology for the report. Mr. Rio stated he wants data such as the number of jobs and energy generation and does not intend the State to spend money to do this research.

Disclaimer: These minutes are not intended as a verbatim transcript of comments at the meeting, but a summary of the discussion which took place; nor does this document attest to the completeness, reliability, or suitability of this information.

Undersecretary Kates-Garnick turned the discussion to Professor Kaufmann's data request as there was sufficient time in the meeting. Professor Kaufmann stated he would like to see hourly data for the quantity of electricity consumed and the price of electricity. Mr. Jhaveri stated this data could be found at ISO-NE. Commissioner Cash said the bid-in price is confidential but can work with ISO-NE to get the data and determine what data is available. Professor Kaufmann asked if data was available on what the utilities pay and at what frequency. Commissioner Cash replied that the data is most likely available, though he is not sure it is as fine-grained as Professor Kaufmann would like. He stated that he would have to discuss with lawyers about how to work with ISO-NE to get this data, in working with the basis of Commission. Hinna Upal responded there should not be a problem in asking ISO-NE for this requested data in the interest of the Commission. Tina Halfpenny proposed putting these data explorations and data sources into the final report.

Next Steps

Undersecretary Kates-Garnick stated that she received a data request from Tom Regh, which will be addressed separately as he was unable to attend the current meeting. She suggested Ms. Halfpenny make comments on his request and the entire Commission can meeting again to discuss Mr. Regh's request. She also stated that she gave a week reprieve for data requests to allow others to submit requests. The Undersecretary stated that the next deliverable will be a "strawman framework", in which EEA will put together in the in the interest of time.

Kevin Galligan inquired if the presenters for the next meeting are still Tom Regh and Tina Halfpenny. He stated that the Program Administrators have been working with Ms. Halfpenny to provide more information for her presentation. Undersecretary agreed Mr. Regh and Ms. Halfpenny were still the scheduled speakers.

The meeting adjourned at 12:25pm.